Gendered Memories of War and Political Violence
Young Researchers Conference

25-27 April 2014

Sabancı University
Karaköy Minerva Palace, Istanbul, Turkey

http://myweb.sabanciuniv.edu/genderconf/
Friday, April 25th

**Introductions**
09:30 – 09.45

Fuat Keyman, Istanbul Policy Institute
Elif İrem Az & Marhabo Saparova (Organizing Committee)

**Opening Panel**
09:45 – 11:15

Speaker:
Arlene Avakian, University of Massachusetts-Amherst

Introduction and Discussion:
Ayşe Gül Altınay (Sabancı University) & Andrea Petö (Central European University)

---

**Genocide Stories and Silences: A Feminist Approach to the Transmission of Trauma, Resistance, and Survival**

The transmission of stories of trauma to the next generation can have a powerful impact on both the narrator and the hearer, although the hearer may not be initially aware of the meaning of what is being told. There are many reasons people who experience trauma want to talk about what they experienced. In the case of the Armenian genocide, tellers may be compelled to tell their truth as a way to counteract the silence and denial about the cataclysm they lived through. My grandmother told me what she called "her story" of that genocide when I was a young teenager and though it lay in my psyche for many years, I did not "hear" what she told me until I was in my thirties. Since that time, I have visited and revisited her story, trying to "hear" all that she had to tell me. The story remained consistent, but what I heard changed as I changed, emotionally, intellectually, and politically. This talk will analyze my grandmother's story as well as her silences from a feminist textual and psychological perspective with attention to the interaction between the teller and the hearer. It will also raise questions, most of which cannot be answered.

Arlene Avakian is Professor Emerita, founder and former Chair of Women, Gender, Sexuality Studies at the University of Massachusetts Amherst. She is author of: *Lion Woman’s Legacy: An Armenian American Memoir* (1992); editor of *Through the Kitchen Window: Women Explore the Intimate Meaning of Food and Cooking* (1997); co-editor of *From Betty Crock er to Feminist Food Studies: Critical Perspectives on Women and Food* (2005) and *African American Women and the Vote 1837-1965* (1997); as well as numerous articles.

---

**Gendering War and Genocide**
11:30 – 13:15

Discussant: Andrea Petö, Central European University

---

**Gender and Intergenerational Transmission of Trauma**

Kalina Yordanova, University College London, England
kalinajord@yahoo.com

Twentieth century has been a century of wars, genocide and other forms of political violence. How do people remember, narrate and transmit their memories of violence? Is there a gender dimension to transmission? This paper explores the transmission of war experience from parents to children in contemporary Bosnia and Herzegovina with a particular focus on gender. It is informed by studies in cultural anthropology and psychoanalysis. The topic is under-researched because in contrast to other war-related issues it requires a long and in-depth work with the whole family touching upon the most intimate aspects of the parent-child relationship. Apart from this problem,
the post-Yugoslav milieu has been primarily examined from political and historical perspective, failing to take into account the in-depth and independent of ethnic or religious background psycho-social phenomena.

The paper suggests that it is not the consistent war narrative but the symbolic and often non-verbal exchange between parent and child where the transmission of the traumatic takes place. This process resembles the dreamwork in which meaning is being delivered in a symbolic form through the mechanisms of condensation and displacement of meaning, and the manifested content must be decoded. The most common symbolic platforms of transmission in the families of war survivors from Bosnia and Herzegovina are illness, complaint, self-harm, war jokes, and art.

Yet, there is a gender dimension to the re-construction of the past. This dimension is due to different roles ascribed to men and women during the war. Women’s life-preserving position during the war manifest in everyday responsibilities for supplying the home with water and food, taking care of the children and migrating in order to find jobs shapes a more consistent war narrative in contrast to men. Men’s ambiguous position defined by the constant shift between the perspectives of the victim, the witness and the murderer as well as their frequent exposure to horror in combat zones contribute to a fragmented and selected version of the past. In addition, second generation’s re-construction of history is based on their imagery of the fathers’ possible transgressions during the war and the mothers’ necessary sacrifices. Such imagery significantly challenges the metaphor of the father in children as a stable enough authority that can sanction and regulate. This partly explains the strengthened religiosity in post-war Bosnia and Herzegovina as a search of an external authority that can introduce morality and law in the absence of a reliable one inside the family.

This paper is based on qualitative research methods that include semi-structured interviews in the mother tongue of the respondents conducted in 2012 in Bosnia and Herzegovina, participant observation in the family, genograms, and children’s drawings. The target group is formed by 30 families of war survivors from Bosnia and Herzegovina of different ethnic and religious background with children between 5.5 and 15 years old who do not have first-hand experience of war but are old enough to separate from the parent for about one hour.

Hegemonic Masculinity
Burcu Albayrak, Abant Izzet Baysal University, Turkey
burcualbayrak34@gmail.com

This research is based on the interviews conducted between September 16th and 30th in Sarajevo Zanica with 20 men and 10 women who have actively participated in the war in Bosnia between 1992 and 1995. It aims at analyzing the construction of the discourse on war and genocide on the basis of hegemonic masculinity with semi-structured interviews and an ethnographic study. Some define The Bosnian War as "heavy genocide". The adjective "heavy" is used for two reasons. First, many people have died in the war. Second, the new generations have been directly effected by the war. Accordingly, the Bosnian genocide has been defined as a "crime against humanity" in the Hague. Thus, one may argue that although 20 years have passed, the war still continues in Bosnia. This condition demonstrates the practice of a particular masculine hierarchy. Genocide and rape are considered as the destruction of those who are subordinated under a hierarchy during the war. The rape and murder of women are considered shameful and a result of the masculinist game. On the other hand, those men who have not participated the war are not considered manly enough.

Although rape has been used in many wars throughout history, it has had different connotations in the context of the Bosnian War. In masculinist ideology, the ethnicity of the baby resembles to the ethnicity of the father. In Bosnia, Serbian soldiers and paramilitary groups called the babies born out of rape "little Chetniks" and "Serbian soldiers". These children who were born back in that period are today 20 years old. Although the expectation of rape—children killing their mothers—is utopic, it is still difficult to discuss the fate of these children in positive terms. In the Bosnian family, women represent innocence and honor. The women victims who felt as if they have lost their honor and innocence were not able to accept their children; those who did were not able to make their
families accept the children. Many marriages ended, and some children were given to orphanages or left alone in the streets. Although it is difficult to remember the rapes and to talk about traumatic events, today these women prove more courageous than before. With the help of many feminist groups (Women against War, Women wearing Black), women victims of war face their perpetrators and try to get them to be punished. Although it is not possible to say that these women are comfortable with their situation or they got over the war, they are hopeful about bringing the perpetrators to the Hague with the pressure of the feminist groups. In any case, through museums, monuments, and memories, both people and cities make us remember that nothing has been forgotten.

Excluded from “Statements”. Creating a discourse on forced prostitutes of KL-Auschwitz-Birkenau by former prisoners and camp staff
Agnieszka Weseli, Independent Researcher, Poland
nie.mam.maila@gmail.com

In my paper, using this kind of source for the research purposes for the first time, I interpret collected and archived “statements” about Puff (germ. Brothel), as an institution and about forced prostitutes from the point of view of gender, national and social origins, function in the camp, the reasons of imprisonment and membership of the camp resistance movement of ex-prisoners who provided evidence. I analyze how different factors influence the perspective in which authors of the “Statements” evaluate the phenomenon of forced prostitution in the camp. I am also interested in the way how they use the narratives about Puff and forced prostitutes to locate themselves in the camp reality (against other inmates, camp staff and forced prostitutes themselves) and how, while commenting on these topics, they create and sustain a discourse that prevailed in Poland for several decades, the one excluding trauma, humiliation, pain and suffering of forced prostitutes, that is the experiences typical for victims of sexual violence.

Masculinities and Femininities in War
14:15 – 16:00
Discussant: Begüm Başdaş, Bilgi University

A Rising New Image in the New Rhetoric of War: Clashing/Homosexual Masculinity
Çiğdem Akgül, Ankara University, Turkey
cigdemakgul1@gmail.com

From Traditional Family to the Modern Individual in the Context of The Social Evolution of Kurdish Identity: The Conflict Zone as a Dynamic of Kurdish Women’s Social Change
Ahmet Vedat Koçal, Dicle University, Turkey
ahmetvedatk@gmail.com

The environment of military conflict and political violence, which has been continuing non-stop for the last thirty years but which has exceeded hundred years in the context of the Kurdish issue, directly affects women and produces various factors transforming women’s identity and their social roles.

As an actor of political violence in the conflict zone that the Kurdish issue produced, the State defined women as either “deceived young women” who have been “used” for propaganda and action in the separatist violence movement or as women sitting at home and “fulfilling their roles”, thus, identified them in the light of traditional gender roles instead of socialized and politicized sub-identities. On the other side of the conflict, women’s groups, even military groups were organized. Differently from men, women who die in the conflict are commemorated as special and privileged. As such, a woman is glorified as a warrior and through her participation in the conflict, is used as a
symbol of crashing down feudal masculine perception. Apart from that, the identification that has been used by both sides of the conflict, especially solidified in examples such as, “Mothers of Martyrs” and “Saturday Mothers”, is the image of “mothers suffering from the loss of their sons”. Therefore, it can be stated that there are distinguishing similarities between women’s role and place in traditional family, which is specific to the agricultural society, and the representation of women in the regional conflict zone. All in all, it should be questioned whether the actors of the conflict approach women as modern individuals and independent citizens outside their features of being “a woman.”

This study will critically evaluate the representation of the Kurdish woman by the actors in the zone of political violence. In addition, it will explore the sources and outcomes of the transformation in the identity of the Kurdish woman due to the sub-structural factors like migration, urbanization, and the shift from agricultural to modern capitalist/urban society.

Palestinian Female Suicide Operations during the Second Intifada: Issues of Gender in Social, Cultural, Security & Violence Socialization Settings
Maria Alvanou, Criminologist & Terrorism Expert, Greece
mariaalvanou@yahoo.gr

The Palestinian-Israeli conflict represents an opportunity to study the phenomenon of women in suicide attacks. During the second Intifada, Palestinian women were used by Palestinian organization in order to carry out suicide operations. It was a step considered as successful especially from the point of view of international public attention. Female suicide attacks and their actors have triggered discussions about issues of equity between female and male fighters inside the organizations and further inside the societies they come from, as well as challenging the image of the nurturing, non violent sex. Given the specific traits (social-cultural-religious) of the Palestinian society and the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, the lecture aims to address certain points that arise regarding gender and perpetrating suicide violence in the context of an armed struggle: How can such a choice made by women be analyzed in the background of patriarchal society settings, feminity stereotypes, motherhood as a strong social model? What role plays womanhood in relation to the socialization in suicide violence, due to the violent everyday condition of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict? How is the female body and its use as a weapon viewed from a strategic point of view by Palestinian organizations and Israeli security? What are the common perceptions of the international public regarding female suicide attackers and how do they measure up in a reality check? Does the recruitment and the participation of women in suicide operations mean emancipation inside Palestinian society?

Crafting Bodies in the Post-Conflict Turkey: Gendered Notions and Practices of “Beauty”
Esin Düzel, University of California San Diego, USA
esinduzel@gmail.com

As the thirty years long conflict between Kurdistan Workers’ Party and Turkish army has been approaching to an end, scholars and broader publics discuss how war-torn communities can rebuild their lives. In that context, reparation perspectives develop without fully grasping gendered experiences of the conflict. This paper traces the formation of gender ideologies around the notion of beauty in two episodes of the conflict in Turkey. First, it examines desexualized body politics in Kurdish nationalist narratives and oral history narratives regarding the intensive war period (1990s). Second, using ethnographic data collected recently in Diyarbakir (2010s), Kurdish-majority city in the southeast Turkey, the paper analyzes the emergence of embodied notions of beauty both in social and political environments. Finally, summarizing the continuities, transformations, and novelties in Kurdish gender ideologies; the paper discusses the implications of diverse conceptions of beauty for the post-conflict reconstruction processes.
Gender and Development at a Time of Conflict Transformation: Reflections on the Kurdistan Region of Iraq
Katherine Ranharter, University of Exeter, England
k.ranhart@hotmail.com

As part of my PhD thesis, I have examined the gendered nature of political policies deployed at the time of conflict transformation, and the influence of the different types of policies (i.e. gender inclusive policies versus policies lacking gender inclusion) on the development of the conflict transformation process and the general population at large. My field research thus concentrated on the Kurdistan Region in Iraq, where I conducted qualitative interviews on the effects of the current government’s actions on the population at large, as well as more specifically on the development of women within the region. I was consequently able to conclude what effect gender inclusive policies or the lack thereof had on the transformation of conflict, including the conflict potential within the region in question.

My research thus falls within the areas of gender studies as well as conflict or peace studies and aims to once again show up the vital connection between the two areas, by illustrating the effects of a decision to deploy gender inclusive policies at a time of conflict transformation can have on development of the conflict-ridden region and its people. At the same time the research is once more proof that full gender inclusion does not yet exist at the time of conflict transformation.

The research has as its special novelty the region of interest and fieldwork conducted. While also the general research idea (examining the effects of gender inclusive policies on the general population at a time of conflict transformation) is relatively unique, its disposition in the Kurdistan Region is a first. Even though the Kurdistan Region in Iraq is currently at an extremely interesting point of its history and at a challenging point of conflict transformation, which can lead as an example for regions, which will be in a similar situation in the future, research inside the region is still scarce and the research on current gender policies is basically non-existent. Furthermore the research on the effects of gender inclusive policies in the Kurdistan Region is of special interest, as the region’s leaders have publicly put the issue of women and gender on the forefront of their conflict transformation measures, and it is thus a by-product of the research to examine if these promises have been kept.

In order to allow a more comprehensive picture of the effects of the policies deployed within the region, I chose to examine the existence of gender inclusive policies and their effects in the political sphere, economic sphere and educational sphere as part of my PhD, but I am happy to select any one of them, in case I was invited to speak at your conference.

The danger of the “Women, Peace and Security” Framework: Absent LGBTQ voices in the post-conflict gender-based violence conversation
Jamie J. Hagen, University of Massachusetts Boston, USA
jamie.hagen@gmail.com

The words gender and women are often used interchangeably in UN development reports and by NGOs working to implement UN Resolution 1325 and UN Resolution 1820. These resolutions were initially created under the framework of “women, peace and security,” a limiting framework that misses many of those individuals marginalized because of their sexuality and gender (LGBTQI and gender non-conforming individuals or example).

While the hope is to bring women to the peace table and strive for a gendered equality in post-conflict, the “women, peace and security” language creates a problematic starting point from which
to do this in terms of gender, to say nothing of issues of class. A key question I’d like to consider as a potential for shifting this narrative is: How might bringing the question of gender as understood by queer theorist Judith Butler and ethicist Carol Gilligan to the fore, change the framing of this work? Informed by the human security approach as it appears in the work of Fiona Robinson and Carol Gilligan’s normative ethical theory of an Ethics of Care, I’d like to explore how more careful attention to gender might improve post-conflict response. Gilligan defined a feminist ethics of care in a recent interview as follows:

“A feminist ethic of care is an ethic of resistance to the injustices inherent in patriarchy (the association of care and caring with women rather than with humans, the feminization of care work, the rendering of care as subsidiary to justice—a matter of special obligations or interpersonal relationships). A feminist ethic of care guides the historic struggle to free democracy from patriarchy; it is the ethic of a democratic society, it transcends the gender binaries and hierarchies that structure patriarchal institutions and cultures. An ethics of care is key to human survival and also to the realization of a global society.” (http://ethicsofcare.org/interviews/carol-gilligan/)

Combining Gilligan’s work on a feminist ethics of care with Judith Butler’s work on masculinity provides an interesting jumping off point to consider how a deeper exploration and inclusion of a gendered feminist approach might inform NGO responses in post-conflict to meet the security needs of the entire community including men, women and the LGBTQI community. Through a consideration of the current economic, social and political indicators used to examine post-conflict peacebuilding protections and implementation of UN Resolution 1325 and UN Resolution 1820 for women I will explore the unintentional silences created by the practices that collect written and oral narratives of gender-based violence that may exclude experiences of the LGBTQ community. Other questions I explore in my research include: What are the pitfalls of the common practice of using the terms gender and women synonymously? Do the NGOs implementing and monitoring UN RES 1325 account for gender as it appears in the LGBTQI community? Is there any analysis of masculinity as defined by the community in which the NGO is working?

Ellen Gorris, International Commission of Jurists (trainee)
ellengorris@gmail.com

In the Master’s Thesis Invisible Victims: Male Rape and Other Forms of Sexual Violence Against Men in Armed Conflict I explored relevant legal and human security frameworks specifically covering wartime sexual violence to assess the position, protection or visibility of the relatively ‘silent’ victim group of male victims. It was found that in the current instruments, the visible victims are ‘women and girls’. They are often included explicitly in legal and policy provisions, thereby seemingly excluding male victims. However, many reports substantiate significant male victimization of wartime sexual violence. The apparent female-focused approach has programmatic implications for male victims, who are underrecognized and under-protected. The instruments in place follow traditional gender roles, where men are conceptualized as aggressive perpetrators and women as non-violent victims, being traditional notions of hegemonic masculinity and heterosexuality. The existing serious dichotomy between visible and invisible victims is prominently based on their ‘gender identity’ and leads to structural discrimination of, for instance, male victims of rape or other forms of sexual violence. To overcome this situation and develop more inclusive instruments, it is therefore advised to reconceptualise the meaning and use of words like ‘gender’, ‘gender perspective’ and ‘gender dimension’. A more intersectional approach to sexual violence should be adopted, understanding that victims have a multitude of identities such as ethnicity or religious affiliation that make them particularly vulnerable to suffering.
Since then I have drafted A More Intersectional Approach: The First Steps in the Acknowledgement of Male Victims of Conflict-Related Sexual Violence by the United Nations (right now being reviewed by editors Andrea Peto and Ayse Gul Altinay for ‘Gendered Wars/Gendered Memories’), which goes beyond the initial research for my master’s thesis, analysing the recent developments in this field. Specifically, I have analysed the ‘emergence’ of the male victim in the latest policy instrument stemming from the United Nations, Resolution 2106. This is the 5th follow-up resolution to the ground-breaking Resolution 1325 on Women, Peace and Security. Resolution 2106, for the first time, refers to a number of other ‘victim groups’ in reference to sexual violence. Whilst the narrative constructs that ‘women and girls’ are those predominantly affected, it is stated that also ‘men and boys’, as well as specifically targeted persons and indirect victims can be victimized. In my opinion, this has signalled the first of many steps that will need to be taken towards taking a more intersectional approach. In my current research I have mapped key actors of change that have attributed towards this ‘emergence’ focussing on civil society, academia, and media outlets, as well as the Prevention Sexual Violence Initiative initiated by the British Government and UK Foreign Secretary William Hague (in collaboration with Angelina Jolie) and the UN Special Representative on Sexual Violence in Conflict. I have argued that though the increased visibility of men and boys is positive, the initial framing of their suffering is wholly problematic. Through a ‘but-also’ construction, certain gender stereotyping is continued, placing sexual violence still as something that happens primarily to women, treating men and boys as secondary victims. I have argued that this is detrimental for the feminist agenda in the long term as it will continue to frame women in weak and vulnerable positions, as well as continuously promoting harmful ideologies when it comes to masculinities.

Truth and Reconciliation Commissions and Gender: Whose Truth?
Hülya Dinçer, Marmara Üniversitesi & Galatasaray Üniversitesi, Türkiye
hdincer77@gmail.com

The post-conflict justice has been developed in the second half of the 20th century. It analyzes the accountability of the crimes committed by the political authorities in the past and heavy human rights violations, with the aim of revealing the truth, providing just recompensation for the victims and developing policies that would prevent such violations in the future. Post-conflict justice policies focus on the role and responsibility of the state in the violations, the official recognition of the violations, the detection of the perpetrators, and their punishment and societal reconciliation. Yet these policies ignored gender in their search for truth, justice and reconciliation and for the mechanisms which would meet the demands. The limited recognition of the violations and the right categories excludes the crimes against women. Thus, women have been excluded from the categories of victims. Furthermore, the representability of women has not been achieved in the creation, structure, and functioning of the mechanisms in post-conflict periods.

The aim of this research is to analyze whether gender approach is effective or not in the process of revealing the individual and societal truths (the process of truth telling) in light of the narratives and testimonies of victims in the countries where there have been intense and systematic violations. Truth and reconciliation commissions focus on the subjective experiences of the victims. They do so because the punishment and judgment concerning the individual perpetrators are limited in the process of providing the accountability in cases of conflicts and authoritarian regimes. They claim to aim at shedding light upon the societal-political context which prepared the ground for violations rather than focusing on the notion of individual crime. Influencing the judgment, legal reform and recompensation policies through their analyses and data collection, truth and reconciliation commissions are assumed to establish a space for public discussion where past violations and future recompensation possibilities are discussed in the multi-layered and flexible process of reconciliation.
However, although the truth and reconciliation commissions claim to aim to go beyond the legalism which is based on the perpetrator-victim duality and to include and make visible the experiences of groups and individuals, they have ignored the experiences of violence by women. Such lack of gender perspective is based on an understanding which privileges the experiences of men in the context of human rights violations. Although the commissions in Peru, East Timor, Sierra Leone included multi-layered gender analyses in their reports, the commissions generally ignored the effects of political violence on women. The categories of “the violation of fundamental human rights” and “heavy human rights violations” established an exclusive violation hierarchy. Those categories which focus on the right to live, body integrity and individual freedom traditionally include the most “fundamental” civil and political rights such as torture, disappearance, extrajudicial killings, and unjust arrests. The private/public divide which is the basis of the law influences the post-conflict justice practices, and frames and naturalizes the violations against women in the private sphere. Therefore, these violations cannot be part of the “extraordinary” space where violence such as torture or extrajudicial killings is discussed. As a result, violations that are outside the sexual violence framework—a type of violence now acknowledged thanks to feminist struggles—that is, violations such as forced migration and the social and economic violence caused by forced migration which effect women immensely, remain excluded. In the light of studies that take on a gender perspective, this research investigates how the experiences of women are marginalized during the reconstruction of the truth for the subaltern against the official history regarding past periods of political violence, and how and through which mechanisms women’s truths are rendered invisible.

Saturday, April 26th

Gendering Resistance I
09.30 - 11.15
Discussant: Nil Mutluer, Nişantaşı University

Discerning Gender and Feminism in the Latin American Context: Revolutionizing Motherhood or Mothering Revolution?
Alize Arıcan & Semuhi Sinanoğlu, Boğaziçi Üniversitesi, Türkiye
alize.arican@gmail.com, semuhisinanoglu@gmail.com

Exuberant political activities of mothers of desaparecidas throughout Latin American countries have aroused interest among scholars across different disciplines. On the one hand, their discourse was construed as apolitical conformism with traditional values and gendered hierarchies. It was asserted that they could not exert any influence to challenge power relations in which women are enmeshed—they were claimed to reproduce those gendered views by clinging to the image of “suffering mother”. On the other hand, they were deemed revolutionaries. It was argued that they utilized “maternal frames” for producing a new form of politics and reversed the meanings of given stereotypes for their advantage by embracing so-called “strategic essentialism” or “mimesis”. In fact, it was asserted that “feminine” and “feminist” interests were merged via these social movements. All these accounts strive to elucidate the complex constellation of “gendered repertoires of contention”.

With resource to the theories of framing in the literature on social movements, we accentuate the temporal and processual relationship between feminist “ideology” and mothers’ mobilization experiences. By embracing a comparative perspective, we scrutinize four social movement organizations established by Madres from different political and social contexts, namely Mothers of Plaza de Mayo in Argentina, CO-MADRES in El Salvador, Agrupacion de Familiares de Detenidos-Desaparecidos (AFDD) and El Poder Feminino in Chile.

Firstly, by distinguishing “frame” from “ideology” theoretically, we will put forward that even ideologically opposite social movement organizations can utilize the same discursive repertoire for
their causes. Secondly, we will reject the assumption of rationality implied by “strategic essentialism” or related framing theories. We claim that rationality is not universal but culturally embedded and this necessitates the introduction of “emotions” as a variable to deconstruct the dichotomy of rationality / irrationality, which is one of the focal points for reproducing certain “feminine” identities. Motherhood, even only pertaining to its purely biological aspect, is not apolitical. Especially via modernization processes undertaken since the beginning of the 20th century, it was loaded with certain duties and meanings. That is why cultural contexts should be treated as significant layer, on which “differently gendered repertoires” operate.

Feminism and Women’s Conscientious Objection from the Perspective of Anti-Militarism
Süheyla Oğuz, Ankara Bar Association, Turkey
suheylaoguz09@gmail.com

Perhaps the definitions of conscientious objection are as many as the numbers of conscientious objectors. Even so, the definition provided by the Amnesty International may offer us a good start to arrive at a general framework about conscientious objection. According to that definition, any individual who, on ethical, religious, philosophical, humanitarian, moral and/or political grounds, refuses to perform armed service or to participate, directly or indirectly, in any type of armed conflict can be considered as a conscientious objector. It is also possible to discuss different attitudes and acts which remains peripheral to the general framework of conscientious objection. For instance, although armed service and reactions arising in many countries against it are often conceived as related only to the male sex, the women who began to declare their conscientious objection have broadened of the general framework concerning the issue.

Turkey has first met with conscientious objection with the statements given by Tayfun Gönül and Vedat Zencir in the issues of Sokak magazine, respectively in 1989 and 1990. The first woman conscientious objector was İnci Ağlagül, and she declared hers in 2004. With İnci Ağlagül’s objection, people has seen that women, who had hitherto been perceived in a passive position with regards to conscientious objection, usually as mothers and spouses of male objectors, can intervene in the matter as capable and active agents. The dialogue between anti-militarism and feminism shaped the general framework for such interventions. But no sooner had women began to declare their conscientious objection than they were seen as “supporters” to male conscientious objectors, despite their intervention. Their positioning as supporters inescapably led to discussions over the stance of "conscientious objection". Today there are 169 conscientious objectors in Turkey, 49 of whom are women.

In this presentation I will present the opinions of women conscientious objectors whose number is growing each day, while discussing anti-militarism from the perspective of feminism. In addition to this part based on interviews conducted with women conscientious objectors, I will also outline the development of women's conscientious objection movement.

Whose Agency Matters? The State, the Military and the Judiciary
Doğu Durgun, Sabancı University, Turkey
dogudurgun@sabanciuniv.edu

Militarization involves many agencies which are simultaneously put forth by various domestic and international actors. With varying identifications, these actors influence the process by reproducing, transforming or challenging the military within a changing (inter)national context. To understand its course of evolution, one needs to question the changing representations/practices of these actors, their subjectivities and how their agencies are (un)counted. This paper investigates this process in Turkey through the analyses of those who reproduce, transform or challenge the military with their acts and declarations in 1990s and 2000s, the state and society’s responses to these events and the judicial processes these actors experienced. In doing so, it asks whose agency matters while discussing militarism in Turkey.
In this paper, I will particularly focus on the post-Gezi events period and the gendered policies of the current AKP government after Gezi Park, which is very much related to the gendered memories of Gezi Park events, I argue.

According to Cyntia Enloe, post-war is a concept that is socially created and we, people as the agents are the creators of it through the experiences and the memories of war. In that sense, what must be remembered after every particular war is complex, social issue with many dynamics. To be able to analyse the complexity one must ask a question as such: in post-war periods, which sort of people are remembered and in what forms?

Each and every war takes place at very particularity of gendered history, so the post-wars. The construction of the notions of the post-war, femininities and masculinities mostly happen simultaneously. On May 27th, 2013 Turkey has started to witness a series of uprisings mostly remembered as the Gezi Events. During these uprisings that have lasted for months, there was an intense conflict between the government, the police and the protestors. According to a survey that provided information on the demographic features of the protestors, the average age of the protestors were 28 and women constituted more than half of them; which mean that the majority of the protestors were young women.

The relationship between the gender, the personal so the public and political is reproduced through visual and audial materials produced during and after the wars or periods of political violence. Focusing on the Gezi events, it is possible to admit that women were the primary symbols of the uprising. The photos of “woman in red” and “woman facing TOMA” have been reproduced in many forms. Also, mothers who made up a chain from their bodies all around the park and the prostitutes who created a feminist awareness by protesting against sexist slogans were acting in solidarity as the activists, despite the different forms of womanhood they hold on to. Hence, women appeared as the heroes of the events, changing long lasting image of woman as the victims of violence.

In this paper, I will argue that right after the Gezi events, AKP’s imposition of conservative policies that are particularly targeting young women became more intense as the powerful image of women become more visible during and right after the Gezi events. Policies like discrediting of the mixed gendered student houses that directly target young women’s sexuality became severe. Besides, as part of the three children discourse that has constantly been used by the prime minister; the draft laws on (1) provision of government incentive in the form of financial credits for the couples who marry young (2) cancellation of the repayment of the student loans for the young couples who marry and (3) the flexible working hours for women, which is very likely to exclude women from labour force has been prepared. I argue that to prevent this conservative discourse to be the dominant and the only one, women must first hold on the powerful identity of agency they created during the Gezi events and protect the existing mechanisms of equality firstly. In addition, women must sustain a constant on going public debate on policies that effects women particularly, in which women participate as the reasonable interlocutors by constantly remoulding the notions of public, private and the different forms of womanhood they have during and after the wars.

Narratives of Migration
11:30 – 13:30
Discussant: Ayşe Parla, Sabancı University

Central to much writing about identity and globalization are the concepts of diaspora and transnationalism, with diasporic and transnational identities coupled with gendered, ethnic and religious identities in the context of protracted refugee situation. Research on protracted refugee situations often draws on simplistic images of refugees as passive, vulnerable, and powerless, while the women, men, and children in protracted refugee situations have different experiences, depending on gendered assumptions about their roles within the family and the refugee community. Similarly, women’s contributions in diaspora in most instances are disregarded as war and displacement is usually regarded as masculine.

Building on the feminist scholarship on forced migration, the research reflects on the “reordering” gender relations in Diaspora as a consequence of forced displacement. It examines the complexities of gender relations, their extreme diversity and how they have been reinforced or challenged as a consequence of diaspora. Drawing on my fieldwork with Afghan refugee communities in Iran, I highlight the ways in which forced migration has contributed to reinforcement of traditional patriarchal norms through analysis of the experiences of Afghan women living in diasporic communities and how it affects their responsibilities of production, reproduction and community work.

The research employs a feminist research technique, which acknowledges the different life experiences of women using gender as a starting point of analysis. It explores how women experience diaspora and how the experiences impact on them physically, psychosocially, economically, socially and culturally. Drawing a vivid picture of Afghan community in diaspora using intense personal narratives, the research illuminates powerful interrogation of the complex relationships between gender, diaspora and identity, told through field observations and dynamic narratives of more than 50 women who belong to Afghanistan’s huge diaspora in Iran. The documentation is extremely participatory and involves Afghan women in the reconstruction of knowledge regarding their social, cultural, and political and identity development.

Building on the multiplicity of women’s stories in diaspora, the research reveals the variety of experiences according to ethnicity, religion, age, class, geographical positioning as well as the social-cultural milieu and socio-economic constraints. The research also builds on the solidarity between Afghan women and men, illustrating how diaspora contests and causes a re-evaluation of gender identities. Consequently, the research explores the challenges to masculine identity experienced by individual Afghan men and the varied ways in which they try to reconstruct their identity within the harsh realities of their lives in diaspora. The research also attempts to elaborate new coping strategies based on Afghan women’s traditional feminine response in turning the void of exile into positive negotiating space for creating new identities.

In 1947, the British Indian Empire was partitioned to create the sovereign states of India and Pakistan. Pakistan’s creation was the result of an ethno-nationalist Muslim political movement in colonial India that sought to create a separate ‘Muslim’ state. The partition of the subcontinent led to the mass migration of approximately 15 million people and large-scale religious and communal riots, political violence, gender-based violence, and a war between the two newly formed nations states. It is reported that 1 million people perished in the violence and over 100,000 women were abducted and raped. Several thousand women were ‘pre-emptively killed’ by their own families in order to
‘protect’ and ‘spare’ them the ‘dishonor’ of sexual violence. Moreover, many women who escaped their rapists and abductors and returned ‘home’ were turned away as they were considered morally ‘tainted.’ The partition of India has been the subject of widespread popular culture (including films, songs, books, plays, poetry) as well as the basis of extensive projects of memorial culture.

In this paper, I seek to explore the gendered dimensions of the partition and the political violence it entailed, as well as the production and creation of the memory of this violence and its link to contemporary politics in the subcontinent. Exploring oral and visual histories and testimonies of the partition from a feminist perspective, I firstly argue that the violence of the partition was deeply gendered in its execution, re-telling, and remembrance(s). Secondly, I argue that the production of memorial culture(s) based on partition violence has utilized gendered bodies to remember (and re-member) collective trauma in the form of multiple contesting and overlapping narratives. These narratives range from the hegemonic state versions to extremist cultural/ethnic/religious nationalist appropriations of the partition. To explore how the gendered memory of political and communal violence of the partition pervades the discourse of contemporary politics in South Asia, I examine select visual sources (film, photography, art) that have been employed in the remembering and retelling of partition violence by various political factions in South Asia. Using gender as an analytical category, I examine the role of these visuals in creating and sustaining competing religious/ethnic/cultural political discourses and conflicts in South Asia. I assert that memorialization and control of women’s bodies and sexualities remain integral to these discourses and to politics in the region. I also assert that feminist readings of the aforementioned visuals problematize dichotomies of victim/agent, personal/political, and the silent/spoken that are often deployed when referring to women in political discourses around the partition. These readings thus highlight ‘alternative’ histories that open up debates on women’s agency and political violence.

Drawing from political and visual anthropology, feminist security studies, and feminist history, and based on archival and field collection of testimonies, this paper aims to be a feminist reading of violence and memorial culture associated with what is considered the largest migration in modern history. By focusing on the widespread presence of gendered memories of violence in nationalist political discourses in South Asia, it aims to add to the existing academic scholarship and to open up a space for feminist activist intervention to counter hegemonic and nationalist notions about gender and violence in South Asian politics.

Narrating Violence as Forced Migrants: Understanding Violence from a Somali Women’s Perspective
Fathima Azmiya Badurdeen, Technical University of Mombasa, Kenya
azmiyab@gmail.com

This paper aims to give an explanation of gender-based violence (GBV) among Somali refugee women in Kenya. Dadaab Refugee camp is a protracted displaced context with decades of displacement resulting in generations of displaced population from Somalia. The study is based on a qualitative exercise of primary research conducted at the Dadaab refugee camp, Kenya complemented with secondary literature. The paper explores gender relations through narratives at camp settings taking into account structural variables such as religion and ethnicity. These variables were analyzed at the pre-conflict, conflict and displacement stages to understand the dynamic changes that prevailed in the lives of women in displaced camp settings. The paper argues that GBV among Somali refugee women in camp settings was part of a broader continuum of violence that existed prior to the conflict and displaced contexts. Nevertheless, violence has been exacerbated in the camp settings with new dynamics such as changes in family settings, physical spaces, cultural changes, security and humanitarian interventions in the process. Women experience gendered forms of violence, such as rape, fear of sexual violence and the social stigma attached to such violence. The fear of sexual violence in the situation of insecurity in armed conflicts and in the place of displacement restricts women’s mobility that do affect their lives in terms of livelihood and choices.
Despite many women’s experience of traumatic violence in displaced contexts, the study also showed that displacement does provide opportunities for changes as refugees are exposed to influences of international aid community and to ideas of gender equality and empowerment. Whilst this can be considered as a double burden for women on roles at family and at community levels, this has led women into prominence enabling them to be in positions of decision-making in their communities.

Melike Gül Demir, Maltepe University, Turkey
melikeguldmr@gmail.com

The purpose of this research is to understand the narratives of the women who migrated to Kanarya neighbourhood of Küçükçekmece, Istanbul, after they were forced to leave their villages that were evacuated as a result of the war between Turkish security forces including the military and the village guards (korucu), and the Kurdistan Workers’ Party (Partiya Karkerên Kurdistan-PKK). According to the reports of non-governmental organizations, four million people were ‘exiled’. This research aims to explore this ‘exile’/ forced migration in connection to the issues such as identity formation and womanhood in Turkey as a nation-state. The reason why Kanarya neighbourhood is chosen as the field of the research is that most of the people who were forced to migrate settled in this part of Istanbul according to the data collected by The Social Assistance and Culture Association of Migrants or Displaced People (Göç-Der). Twenty four in-depth interviews have been conducted with twenty four women between the ages 32 and 67, from Mardin, Siirt and Şırnak.

The interviewees state that they had to take shelter in the houses of their relatives who had already been living in big cities and their small children had to work in order to support their families. Although they want to return to their villages, poverty, continuation of the existence of village guards and the fear of facing the same violence and oppression in the case of a possible return prevent them from doing so.

Socially discriminated because of their mother tongue (Kurdish) and their way of dressing, women articulate ‘peace’ as the only hope for them to free from cultural and ethnic discrimination, to become equal female citizens of Turkey and not to experience any more losses. This study argues that women are politicized by the deaths of their husbands, fathers, brothers, and children. They become aware of their rights by experiencing their absence. As a result of these experiences of forced migration and state violence they developed a will that deny all kinds of power and oppression relations that put women into secondary and dominated positions.

Between Collective Memory and Experience: The Perceptions of State Violence among Second Generation Kurdish Migrant Women in Tarlabası
Övgü Ülgen, Truth Justice Memory Center, Turkey
ovgu.ulgen@gmail.com

With the eruption of war in the Eastern and Southeastern regions of Turkey during the 1990s, state violence has begun to leave its imprints more on internal migration which intensified observably after the 1980s. The experiences of migrant generations in their new habitations of bigger cities are thus crucial to grasp the violence at stake in its full breadth. Yet it is also a topic which remains, by and large, unexplored. This study primarily concentrates on the ways in which women from the second generation of migrants who live in Tarlabası after moving there due to state violence experience this violence under the conditions of the city and the era within which they live. Life in the city is handled and brought into question in relation to the topics of solidarity and identity in the neighbourhood of Tarlabası.

The second generation women, whose ages are mostly between 20 and 30, regard the state violence of the 1990s as integral to their personal narratives, despite the fact that they did not
experience it directly in the Eastern and Southeastern regions unlike many members of the first
generation. If the effects of the ruptures and continuities in the narratives upon the constitution and
transition of memory are taken into consideration, the concept of "experience" gains far more depth
than assumed. Tracing the relation between "experience" and "collective memory" through in-depth
interviews is therefore crucial to make a contribution to the growing literature on memory, alongside
an emphasis on some aspects of the state violence which remain above the fray.

If we bring into consideration the silencing imposed on Kurds to date through the state
discourses disseminated on terrorism and internal enemies, verbal narratives gain utmost
significance with respect to the consolidation of state power and the reproduction of state violence.
It is possible to observe in these verbal narratives that memory can turn into a means of resistance
against the neutralizing discourses of the state. The first generation whose villages were occupied,
burnt, pillaged, and plundered deploys memory as a means of resistance by telling their silenced
stories and maintaining memory. This study examines the reception and politicization of vicariously
experienced state violence by women belonging to the second generation of migrants.

In my MA dissertation from 2013, entitled “Le déplacement forcé kurde après les années 1990
sur la naissance d’une identité communautaire à Tarlabası, Istanbul,” I studied the neighbourhood
identity in Tarlabası entailed by the forced migration of the 1990s. The collective memory of migrants
was at the scope of the in-depth interviews conducted with those who reside in this particular
neighbourhood. Through the findings derived from these interviews I aim to enrich and deepen my
dissertation as well as the knowledge of the field, while restoring the personal stories usurped in
many ways to their rightful owners, by sharing those narratives with as many people as possible.

**Gendered Postmemories**
14:30 – 16:15
**Discussant: Leyla Neyzi, Sabancı University**

**Silent Voices: Kyrgyz Women, “The Great Patriotic War,” And Postmemory in Chingiz Aitmatov’s
Early Work**
Gulzat Egemberdieva, University of Toronto, Canada
egemberdievagulzat@gmail.com

“The Germans are very close, we are now in Stalingrad. We are still alive today, but who
knows for how long?” These words were written by Mansur to his mother Tyrmaktai, a peasant
woman from the mountain village Ichke Suu in Northern Kyrgyzstan. Tyrmaktai, who was my great-
grand mother, always kept this letter on her, until her death. This paper seeks to retrieve the voices of
women such as Tyrmaktai, who were never able to tell their story, whose trauma was “outside the
range” of the “Great Patriotic War,” celebrated until the present day in Kyrgyzstan, as in many parts of
the former Soviet Union. Using a feminist perspective, inspired by Laura S. Brown (“Not Outside the
Range: One Feminist Perspective on Psychic Trauma,” *American Imago*, Spring 1991), I examine the
“daily and insidious trauma” of women very much like Tyrmaktai, who were brought to life, but were
not entirely invented, in the early stories of the Kyrgyz writer Chingiz Aitmatov. Fiction and life are
indeed always closely intertwined in Aitmatov’s work, and women are among his main characters.
Aitmatov’s father had been a victim of the Stalinist purges. His mother, like countless other women,
had to bear the fate of those who lost their husbands, brothers, fathers and sons in famine-ridden
Central Asia. Several of Aitmatov’s earliest stories, such as “Betme bet” (Face to Face), can be
considered the result of “postmemory.” It tells the story of a deserter, who returns home and hides in
a cave near his village. His wife with a newborn child and his sick mother have to bear the burden of
this secret, in addition to the difficulties of daily life. Given the time when “Face to Face” was
published (1957), the end was very much conform to “socialist realism”: understanding that love has
to yield to patriotic duty, she hands over her husband to the security forces. This ending itself has a
traumatic aspect. Aitmatov rewrote the story after the collapse of the Soviet Union. As he explains
(confesses?) in his 1990 foreword, he added a chapter and provided another ending to the story. Now desertion has become the drama of the individual, his family, and the impossibility of duty. The paper concludes with the analysis of “Dzhamilia,” published in 1958, a year after “Face to Face.” Aragon was certainly right to call it “la plus belle histoire d’amour du monde.” I wonder whether it was not a hidden, and traumatic sequel to what he published a year before. This time, the wife (Dzamilia) “betrays” not only her husband, a hero of the Great Patriotic War, but also the customs of Kyrgyz culture, to escape to freedom with her lover. I argue that it was a way for Aitmatov to escape himself, and, by some sort of “retroactive transference,” to give voice to the women who had made him a writer.

Children of the White Men
Yelda Başaran Usupbeyli, University of Paris 8, France & Akdeniz University, Turkey
yeldabasaran@gmail.com

Contemporary French women filmmakers in their autobiographical documentaries, often return to their family to delve into their past, as a kind of quest for identity. These autobiographical films of course concern the privacy/intimacy of the filmmaker who feels the need to disclose a subject which is at first sight personal, therefore not likely to appeal to a wide audience. But personal history is always in relation to collective History. These films, by revealing the family to be an impediment to any full or complete constitutive rendering of one’s self as a subject in history, obviously don’t fit the classic model of Western autobiography, as it was defined according to some classical texts, notably of Rousseau and Goethe. They can rather be considered as examples of the autoethnographic impulse, wherein cultural concerns are explored or displayed through the representation of the self. Catherine Russell asserts that “[a]utobiography becomes autoethnography at the point where the film—or videomaker understands his or her personal history to be implicated in larger social formations and historical processes”. As examples of autoethnographic cinema, Russell takes the experimental autobiographical works emerged in the 1980s and 1990s in USA. Since we would like to talk about the documentary films, we adopt the concept of “domestic ethnography” that Michael Renov coined in his article “Domestic Ethnography and the Construction of the ‘Other’ Self”. Renov explains the concept and its use as “a vehicle of self-examination, a means through which to construct self-knowledge through recourse to the familial other”. It is a practice in which autobiographical self-examination adds to the concern of the ethnographer to document the lives of others.

As case study, we will analyse Les Enfants du Blanc (Children of the White Men, France-Burkina Faso, 2000) of Saray Bouyain, daughter of a French mother and a Burkinabe father, in which she explores her mixed-race roots. The film reveals a family secret but also shows us a forgotten aspect of the civilizing effects of colonization. Born in Upper Volta (now Burkina Faso), Bouyain’s grand mother is the offspring of the meeting of a French colonial and an African girl. Like the mother of Bouyain’s grand mother, many Burkinase girls were requisitioned by the French army during the first decade of the twentieth century to become women of the French lieutenants. The children born from these unions, generally abandoned by their French fathers, were placed into specially created orphanages. The fate of these indigenous women and their children is almost absent from the history books. Through the testimony of her grand mother Sarah Bouyain discovers the singular destiny of this mulatto minority to which she belongs to and reconstructs the puzzle of her heritage. Postmemory is a useful characterization of the transitive autobiographical aspect of Children of the White Men. Bouyain binds herself to a memory not her own yet integral to the formation of her own identity. “Postmemory characterizes”, Hirsch states, “the experience of those who grow up dominated by narratives that preceded their birth, whose own belated stories are displaced by the stories of the previous generation, shaped by traumatic events that they can neither understand nor recreate”. Sarah Bouyain not only treats personal and family memory as historical, but also treats history as personal. Children of the White Men thus, can be considered as an exemplary of the crisis
of definition and categorization that plagues documentary, autobiography and identity, opening the borders of autobiography to an expansive definition of an historical subjectivity.

**Reading Sexualised Violence through the Postmemory of Conflict in Bosnia-Herzegovina**
Lydia Cole, Aberystwyth University, England
lyc3@aber.ac.uk

This paper will look at the intertwining and productive relations between the memory of sexualised violence in Bosnia-Herzegovina and its evolving postmemory. Centrally I ask how the concept of postmemory can help us theorise this relationship between memory and postmemory in order to explore how processes of memorialisation are gendered. Marianne Hirsch coins the term ‘postmemory’: memory mediated through creative innovation such as film, novels and photography, distinguished from memory by generational distance and from history by a sense of deep personal connection. Hirsch and others use the concept in order to engender the collective memory of the Holocaust, asking feminist questions such as where are the women, and where can their voices be found? The concept has been called into question by Ronit Lentin in ‘Femina Sacra: Gendered Memory and Political Violence’. She muses that it might be ‘fair to ask whether all memory is but ‘postmemory’’. Lentin’s point is a fair one in this case, challenging the foundations of what we mean by memory however, I argue that there is further utility to the concept. By distinguishing between memory and postmemory, we are able to read creative innovations by those who are not straightforwardly ‘survivors’ as a contribution to the collective memory of conflict. The evolving creative innovations regarding the conflict in Bosnia-Herzegovina, is an example where a critical engagement with postmemory is useful and necessary. During the latter stages of the conflict and its direct aftermath both journalists and academics documented the use of rape in war in Bosnia-Herzegovina. These offer an important feminist grounding to the paper. Since then, there have been multiple creative innovations related to the conflict. This paper will look specifically at ‘Grbavica: Esma’s Secret’ and Drakulić’s ‘S – A Novel about the Balkans’. It will more specifically view these films through the lens of postmemory in order to ask questions about how the memory of (sexualised violence in) conflict is (re)produced. I push the limits of the term postmemory to explore its analytical potential and further draw conclusions about how the postmemory of sexualised violence constructs various subjectivities. I will focus specifically on the generational distances and narratives of motherhood in these two mediums. The paper proceeds in three substantive parts. Firstly I address Hirsch’s conception of postmemory, highlighting the spaces for the appropriation of the term. I will move on to assess the rememberings and silences surrounding children born from sexual violence in conflict firstly in ‘S – A Novel about the Balkans’ and then in ‘Grbavica: Esma’s Secret’. In the final part the paper reflects on the concept of postmemory and its interaction with the collective memory of the conflict.

**Trans* Sex Worker Mothers and Their Daughters: the Role of the Transition of Memory within the Trans* Community of Istanbul in Their Struggle against Systematic Police Violence**
Dilara Çalışkan, Sabancı University, Turkey
dilaracaliskan@sabanciuniv.edu

The literature on trans* women is often concerned with the experiences of trans* women resulting from prejudices and discrimination against them. Research and released reports highlight how the acts of hatred and discrimination have blighted the daily lives of trans* individuals. Notwithstanding that, the fact that the trans* individuals come together and resist in the face of such discriminatory discourse and acts by making use of various instruments is a blindspot in much of this research. Therefore, this research, by looking at the fictive mother-daughter relationship within the community of trans* sex workers, seeks to pursue the effects of that fictive relationship upon the transition of the memory of violence from one generation to the next. While doing so, it will not only lend an ear to the narratives of "mothers" and "daughters", but also discuss the transition of memory
among different age groups through the case of Hortum Süleyman, and the effects of such transition on the resistance of young trans* individuals against violence. Finally, I will analyze the memory of violence caused by a person called Hortum (Hose in English) Süleyman - the chief of police in Beyoğlu district between the years of 1996-1997 who is known for his torture of trans* individuals with a variety of hoses in different colors and sizes. I will do so from the perspective of Marianne Hirsch’s concept of post-memory and with a particular attention to the fictive mother-daughter relationship.

In this study I will initially unfold the different dynamics of relationships within the trans* community of İstanbul, especially the mother-daughter relationship. Then, while discussing when the mother-daughter relationship may pose an alternative to the existing structures or run the risk of reproducing them, I will bring into view the significance of the mother-daughter relationship from the lens of post-memory, by taking the Hortum Süleyman case as an example. As I analyze the relationships between trans* individuals in line with Marianne Hirsch, I will address how the unprecedented form of torture the mothers were subject to by Hortum Süleymen left marks in the memories and future anxieties of daughters. In addition, I will discuss the roles of the transition of memory between generations and the alternative mother-daughter relationship established within the trans* community during their fervent struggle against sexist violence with regards to the systematic violence and silencing practices that the trans* community is facing.

Consequently, this research, by treating the mother-daughter relationship within the trans* community as one of the resistance mechanisms of those who have been subjected to systematic violence for more than thirty years, aims to pose an alternative to the literature where trans* individuals are usually represented merely as the “victims” of the system. Apart from the struggles waged for the visibility and organization of trans* individuals, the representations and perspectives provided by the academic field are proven vital for the future prospects of the movement. Therefore this study does not only challenge the global literature where the long-suffering trans* individuals are represented as passive figures lacking in subjectivity, but also calls attention to the dynamics within the trans* community which echoes in the daily lives of its members.

Gendering Resistance II
16.30 - 18.15
Discussant: Nükhet Sirman, Boğaziçi University

Suicide as a Social Fact: an Analysis of the Causal relationship between Patriarchal Constructions and the Arab Spring Self-Immolation
Loubna EL Moncef, Ibn Tofail University, Morocco
elmoncef@loubna@gmail.com

This study investigates the phenomenon of self-immolation in the wake of the Arab spring and examines the impact of society and social factors on individual decisions or actions. In support of Durkheim’s claim that suicide is a social fact, this study reinforces a causal relationship between patriarchal constrictions in the Middle East and the Arab spring self-immolations.

The first part of this study suggests a meticulous exploration of suicide theories as developed by Durkheim and his contemporaries and later sociologists. The issue of suicide has always been a major issue in the field of sociology. While it remains a source of ambiguity in the field of psychiatry, the phenomenon of suicide in sociology is relatively deciphered through the study of its primary social causes. Sociologists, starting with Emile Durkheim to Christian Baudelot, tend to explain an individual behavior by social facts. They resort to the science of statistics to study suicide rates which vary from one country to another according to certain variables namely sex, age, religion, professional status, marital status...

The second part however is entirely devoted to the study of the Arab spring self-immolation as an individual decision primarily influenced by certain religious and cultural institutions and ideologies. More accurately, this study claims that the Arab spring self-immolator is the product of gender socialization in the context of patriarchal culture. In the aim to assert this claim, this research
suggests a thorough analysis of cultural rituals and rites of passage which contribute significantly to the construction of Arab masculinities. In doing so, this study describes Arab masculinities’ struggles to conform to male modal measurements and gendered norms for fear of social exclusion and disintegration. It goes further to reveal the plight of Arab men under patriarchal constructions and constrictions.

Based on Durkheim’s theory of suicide (suicide is a social fact), this study claims that the Arab spring self-immolator is the product of his own patriarchal culture. The Arab spring self-immolation is presented as another rite of passage which contributes to the modification of male status through his ability to endure pain and burns.

The Potential and Limitations of Feminist History: The Representation of Revolutionary Women from 1960-70 in Recent History
Derya Özelay, Sabancı University, Turkey
deryaozkaya@sabanciuniv.edu

1970s is a period that is attracted the least attention from the historians who work on recent history of Turkey. It is usually referred as “pre-coup d’état” as if it was a homogenous historical period and usually that period is explained as an environment of chaos, terror, conflict between left and right. However, beginning from the 1960s, but especially during 1970s, large masses have been politicized and started to struggle for their rights through labor unions and political parties. 1970s is an important period when the large masses politicized and alternative political and social organizations were established. It is the period that a lot of significant political and social events, those are still open to think and discuss about, were occurred.

The historiography of this period is male-dominated as the historiography in general. Historical research, political assessments, oral histories and memories of this period are written by men and they often tell men’s stories. Women kept their silence for a long time and tried to strive to survive in this restricted history. There is no doubt that these political, social and cultural radical transformations were reflected on women. Where were these women in this period? What did they live and feel? How did they contribute to this social transformation?

We know from the increasing number of women history studies that women were everywhere as men including armed struggle, acts of organization in both factories and neighborhoods, in strikes and boycotts and they were active participants. They became effective with their productivity, patience and resistance in this transformation and also they were affected by it.

Publications of several feminist organizations, books published by feminist publishers, women organizations of some leftist political parties or labor unions, centers of gender and women studies in universities, independent women writers’ books, academic researches, documentaries and exhibitions made several experiences, which have been ignored, forgotten or silenced for long years, visible. This diversity in women studies is very important in order to show us the potentiality of feminist history. However, all these works excluded - consciously or not- lots of topics, figures or processes as much as they could cover. And these show us the restrictions of feminist history besides its potentialities.

I believe that this opposition movement, beginning from 1960s and started to rise during 1970s with its political and social transformations, should be reinvestigated by women’s perspectives. These kinds of researches have the potential to provide us important knowledge about women’s wishes and desires about change and their contributions to this process.

Could these women become active subjects of this period? If they could, how and through which mechanisms? How were they included to the political and social life? What did they feel and think? How did they perceive being a revolutionary woman? How did they become different from men in this sense? What did they think about armed struggle and how did their thoughts change through time? What kind of collectivities did they accomplish? What did they feel and live after they broke with that collectivity? All these questions are being waited to be answered.
It is important to answer these questions in order to form connections between women from different generations with different political experiences and establish continuity within these experiences. It is envisaged that the answers to these questions will make a contribution to both the Turkish left with its limited and male-dominated literature of 1970s and also it will provide continuity for feminist literature beginning from the Ottoman feminists to the present.

Bürge Abiral, Sabancı University, Turkey
burgabiral@sabanciuniv.edu

The 1980 military coup on September 12th in Turkey and the following three-year military dictatorship suppressed most political opposition through street violence, extrajudicial killings, arbitrary incarceration, and acts of physical and psychological torture under custody and in prison. Women from a variety of ages actively participated in different oppositional groups before and after the coup, were taken under custody and imprisoned for different durations due to charges ranging from hanging illegal posters to engaging in armed action. Yet their political participation as well as their experiences during imprisonment were silenced in the memory and historiography of the period in general, and in the memory of leftist organizations in particular. Despite this erasure and self-silencing, some women testified about their time under custody and in jail in written and visual documents.

In this paper, I analyze the existing narratives by ex-prisoner women in order to shed light to their experiences. I’m attempting to first understand the gendered aspect of violence executed on women in custody and in prison and, second, discuss how gender dynamics influenced women’s resistance during incarceration. Women’s narratives suggest that hegemonic codes of acceptable femininity determined how police officers and prison guards perceived politically active women. Women were thus categorized either as sisters in need of protection or fallen women. While, according to existing accounts, at times officials treated women more leniently than men, more often they punished them through forms torture that aimed their sex. In this highly gendered context, women’s resistance meant not only the denial of authority sanctioned by the nation-state, but also the denial of the roles traditionally assigned to women. In other words, it was an assertion of political subjectivity, when politics were not considered women’s space. Yet narratives also reveal that there were times when women opted out of resistance when they were faced with the threat of rape and sexual harassment, a phenomenon which challenges the heroic accounts of female resistance which prevails in studies on women and September 12th.

Gendered Languages of Belonging: Mozambican female ex-combatants making sense of their war memories
Jonna Katto, University of Helsinki, Finland
jonna.katto@helsinki.fi

Sunday, April 27th

Memories of Loss, Mourning and Melancholia
09:30 – 11:15
Discussant: Banu Karaca, Sabancı University

Singing with a “burning heart”: Kurdish women singers, contagious voices and the politics of mourning in Turkish Kurdistan
Marlene Schäfers, University of Cambridge, England
marlene.schafers@gmail.com
“The songs that I sing are for my pain, for the pain of my heart,” Fatma, a Kurdish woman singer once told me. “The more your heart is burning the more you will sing painful songs,” she continued, explaining that without a “burning heart” you could not become a singer. Fatma’s own heart was burning because of the pain she had experienced as a result of the decade-long armed struggle between the insurgent Kurdistan Workers’ Party (PKK) and the Turkish state: one of her sons had died in battle and become a “martyr” for the Kurdish freedom fight, while another of her sons was still fighting with the PKK in the mountains and her only daughter was imprisoned for her pro-Kurdish activism.

This paper seeks to address how Kurdish women singers like Fatma, by relentlessly singing about their hearts which are “burning” due to decades of political violence come to be engaged in a Kurdish politics of mourning. Through their songs, women singers mourn for those whose lives are not publicly grievable, and they thus transform the death of those publicly labelled as “terrorists” into good deaths, recuperating those who have been lost into a moral community. By way of singing Kurdish women arrive at including their dead into the realm of the living and in this way allow a past marked by political violence to suffuse and thoroughly saturate the present. As this paper will argue, their aim is thus not to overcome suffering or to make wounds heal, but precisely the opposite: to keep existing wounds open. In this way women singers contribute to the formation of Kurdish subjectivities as marked primarily by suffering and thereby participate in what lies at the heart of Kurdish political mobilization.

The aim of this paper is to go beyond a textual analysis of narratives, however, by investigating how the material quality of women’s voices is central to the politics of mourning they are engaged in. I propose to conceive of women’s singing as a “technique of the body” (Marcel Mauss), which has concrete material and physical effects. The latter include the physical production of sound itself but also the fact that female Kurdish singers regularly make their audiences cry. In this light, I want to conceptualize women’s singing not only as a form of remembering political violence that challenges the hegemony of the Turkish state, but also as a technique that seeks to fabricate pain and which operates with a voice that acts as a – literally – contagious force, interpelling its listeners as both political and gendered subjects.

The Significance of the Gendered Melancholy Memory in Transitional Justice: The Narratives of Women from the Southeast
Cansu Bostan, Oñati International Institute for Sociology of Law, Spain
cansu_bostan@yahoo.com

"If you want to kill someone, you just shoot it in the head and it ends. But they are killing us over and over. This is not a murder, this is something else.”

Massacres are forms of killing over and over. They are cultural and they have symbolic meanings. All these killings and deaths establish a memory far more authentic than the official history. Turkish history can be defined as a perpetual melancholy memory, put differently, a melancholy that produces itself anew. Mourning is a description prompted by a loss. According to Freud, it is the symbolization process of the loss...

The Kurdish population in Turkey is enmeshed in a perpetual state of melancholy. The Peace Process and its accompanying mechanisms dispense with the memory. As social scientists keep discussing the existence of gendered memory, there is no doubt that the melancholy memory in the Southeast has a sex and its sex is woman.

In this project, drawing on Irigaray’s idea of rejecting masculine language for the construction of feminine subjectivities, I aim to investigate the role of feminine memory for the functioning of the society and the individual.
mechanisms of transitional justice, by undercutting the melancholy imposed by statist policies, thereby allowing the emergence of a different temporality where mourning becomes possible. The distinction Irigaray poses in her *Speculum* between “speaking like a woman” and “speaking as a woman” thus has a prominent place in this study. Speaking as a woman points to a social positioning. When one speaks as a woman the language that is used is the language of power, not a feminine language. However, the feminine narrative of memory will also give way to “speaking like a woman” and this way the power order will find a new definition through the creation of a feminine language based on feminine memory. The method at stake in this study will be treated in dialogue with Butler’s premise for the mourning process as a requisite for global justice and with Héléne Cixous’s dream diaries, mourning, and witnessing. And this theoretical framework will be studied by collecting the feminine narratives of memory from the Southeast, or heeding Irigaray once again, by creating a feminine language via bringing the feminine memory into language as opposed to the language of power adopted by the mainstream memory and official narratives of history. Contrary to the masculine narrative of the language of power where women are subjectified and sanctified for their fertility and motherhood, this study will be a feminine narrative on the violence of the power order. For the violence of the power order finds its truest forms in the memory of a mother of a murdered son whom she cannot bury, a mother who is stuck in a perpetual mood of melancholy that renews itself with each and every killing. Hopefully, the narratives collected from the region will show the dearth of memory studies regarding the mechanisms of transitional justice.

As stated before, this study will link the operations undertaken by the Turkish state under the name of “the Peace Process” to the issue of transitional justice. The "peace" cannot take place though, without overcoming the memory established by media and education for years, with recourse to various images and symbols. The memory of women in the Southeast can be identified through the inability of a mother to mourn and describe the lack deriving from her loss, a loss whom she cannot bury.

**The River, The Archetype of Forgetting: Art, Gender, Memory**

Fanny Montes, Universidad del País Vasco, Spain

[ekamon88@yahoo.com.br](mailto:ekamon88@yahoo.com.br)

The following is a chapter of my Anthropology thesis. The research was done in a little town in Colombia were the violence has had a strong presence in the last sixty years. It was based on in-depth interviews to 20 women and 20 men, focused on how they remember the period of *La Violencia* (the violence, 1948-1958) five decades ago, seeking if there was any gender difference in the way the past was remembered. After two years of research, with Carl Jung’s conception of archetypes, three elements were found in the different narratives of the population under research: the birds, the mount and the river. The distinctiveness resides on how and in what degree these images were presence in the reminiscence of the violent past by women and men. Men made more emphasis on the “Birds” (a euphemistic designation used by the population to identify the paramilitary groups throughout the recent Colombian history). However, women put more emphasis in the river (were the perpetrators threw human bodies) and in the mountain (the place where the population hides from the perpetrators). Each archetype was saturated with a variety of cultural information, and for this occasion I will present the development of one of the archetypes worked throughout the research: the river.

The disappearance of human bodies in rivers perpetrated by the different armed groups in Colombia has been a persistent element in nearly seventy years of war (1948-2013). The image of a body floating in a river has become a constant in the daily narratives of violence all over Colombia’s countryside. This image is not only persistent in the narratives of the memories from people who lived in the violent period, but it is part of the culture: books, movies, myths and art.

6 Héléne Cixous, “Rüya Dedim Sana” (2009), (Çev. Elif Gökteke), YKY: İstanbul.
This article, considering the river as an archetype, has the purpose of establishing a connection between the roots of Colombian society – a hybrid between Western culture and different indigenous cultures – and the narrative of violence. The experience of the population with ‘the river’ is ambivalent. While on the one hand the rivers are an important factor in the economy of the different communities (for food and as a source of income), on the other hand they have been used by the perpetrators as a means of impunity. The disappearance of human bodies in rivers not only destroys the evidence, but also leaves behind a foreboding to the rest of the population in the form of stolen mourning, fear and silence.

Sometimes the aim of social science is to put in words something that is evident, to deconstruct and denaturalize cultural elements. Two artistic expositions have worked with the image of the river as a way of breaking the silence that massacres have imposed to the population: *Magdalenas en el Cauca* and *Río Abajo*. These two experiences highlight the relationship between women and oral memory, represented in visual art.

**Enforced Disappearances through the Narratives of Women**

Özlem Kaya, Boğaziçi University & Truth Justice Memory Center, Turkey

ozlemky@gmail.com

"Enforced disappearances" as a state strategy is not a condition specific to Turkey. In many countries where internal conflicts prevail, the state has and had resorted to enforced disappearances as a strategy for suppressing dissent, spreading its power as well as fear of uncertainty over society. In Turkey, enforced disappearances were adopted as a state strategy initially against the leftist, socialist groups after the military coup of 1980. Then it was employed to the demise of Kurdish citizens during the 1990s once again, but this time in a more systematic manner and as part of the Turkish state's campaign against the PKK. The reports released by various institutions, most notably human rights associations working on the subject and other individuals acknowledge that 1353 people were made disappear in Turkey, mostly between the years of 1993 and 1995.

Naming what is called the problem of terror or the state's struggle against terrorists in the hegemonic discourse as war certainly marks the first steps toward releasing history from the reins of hegemonic language. Describing enforced disappearances in its full breadth, as a violent strategy employed by the state, is therefore dependent on such a new treatment of the matter at hand. This presentation will even take a step further by conveying this state strategy through the experiences of women who survived. Hereby, the aim is to concentrate on the ways in which state violence related to enforced disappearances during the 90s war is narrated and experienced by women.

In the case of Turkey, %90 of those who were made disappear is males. This study seeks to present the effects of losing a person who works outside to sustain the household for women, while incorporating these effects into the historical narrative as the most tangible result of the abovementioned statistics. It attempts so while addressing the impacts of all forms of violence accompanying enforced disappearances, yet only through the narratives and experiences of women.

Truth Justice Memory Center, as part of its archival and memorialization research concerning enforced disappearances, conducted a study with the wives of those who were made disappear, with a particular focus on the experiences of womanhood. Accordingly, in-depth interviews were conducted with approximately thirty women. The results deriving from the interviews are also the data this presentation primarily wants to share. For the goal is to have a contribution to the discussion and understanding of history through the narratives of women, namely the history of the 1990s and the Kurdish geography which also includes the struggles and strategies of women to cope with the impacts of enforced disappearances.
Discussant: Füsun Üstel, Galatasaray University

Examining War through Women’s Magazines: Women’s World and the First World War, From Feminism to Nationalism
Atacan Atakan, Boğaziçi University, Turkey
atacanatakan88@gmail.com

The Second Constructionalist period announced in 1908 has brought not only institutional changes but also rights and freedoms for many communities. Even though it was not continuous, women were a section of society that benefitted from this environment of freedom. During the Second Constructionalist period (including the one party period after the Bab-ı Ali Invasion) women witnessed novelties in education, work, cultural and social spaces, and family life. In 1914, women gained the right to study at university, and high schools opened for female students. In 1913, Ottoman Muslim women for the first time started to work as state clerks. The Family Law in 1917 brought new developments regarding divorce, marriage, and the responsibilities of men and women towards each other. These developments encompassed positive discrimination of women in family and marriage life.

Apart from these, another improvement occurred in the realm of media. During Second Constructionalist period and Abdulhamid II’s rule, censorship and tight restrictions on media were removed. This move resulted in the numerical burst of newspapers and magazines. Women’s magazines, too, increased in numbers and their content started to change. Starting with Demet (1908), Mehasin (1908) and Kadın (1908), about 30 magazines were published in that period. Topics included education, participation in social life, fashion, literature, women’s issues, liberal arts and contemporary issues.

When the women’s magazines of that period are analyzed, it is possible to see that the content and the language of the magazines are parallel to the government’s mentality. This condition becomes more visible in and after 1913 (due to the effects of Balkan Wars and the First World War). In this sense, the magazine Kadınlar Dünyası (Women’s World) had a prominent role. The magazine showed great efforts in regards to women’s rights, discussed these issues widely and accomplished various activities on this subject throughout its publication. The magazine approached women’s issues and women’s rights from a feminist perspective. Osmanlı Müdafaa-i Hukuk-i Nisvan Cemiyeti (Ottoman Association for Women’s Rights Advocacy) was an organization connected to the magazine, supported Ottoman women’s movement, and served as spokesperson for women. Although the magazine appropriated a feminist stance, when it came to the survival of the empire it adopted hegemonic nationalist discourse. As Beth Baron stated in his work on Egyptian women, during the independence wars, the women’s movement put their liberation/emancipation struggles to the background. Even though this condition did not entirely apply to Kadınlar Dünyası, from time to time its language slipped from a feminist discourse to a nationalist one.

In this presentation, I will examine and explain how the feminist magazine Kadınlar Dünyası approached war, from which angles it dealt with war, and how it worked. I will narrate how war, an initiative of male hegemonic space, was reflected in women’s world through the magazine. I will fill time lap that corresponds to the First World War when it was not published with narratives about other women’s magazines. Thus, I will also include a comparative perspective. Generally, Kadınlar Dünyası is discussed with regards to women’s rights and Ottoman women’s movement. I expect my research to contribute to the questions of how women’s magazines address a different space and to what extent they coincide with the hegemonic discourse.

Gendered Lessons of the Military Nation: Rukhnama
Marhabo Saparova, Sabanci University, Turkey
marhabo@sabanciuniv.edu
The 20th century has been a century of the formation of nation-states and national ideologies in the region of Central Asia as in many other parts of the world. The attempt of these newly “independent” countries to build a national state is what Paul Connerton calls “a concerted effort to begin with a wholly new start.” Moreover, this beginning has never come out of nowhere, it has been linked to the past and conceptualized as a sleeping beauty complex in the official national narratives. The nation awakens to reclaim its “stolen” past and to recreate its own distinctive national identity. In this paper I would like to analyze how the Turkmen national identity was constructed and has been reproduced through education, through the recreation and the consolidation of national memory. More specifically I will be conducting a detailed examination of the militarist and gendered discourse in the official national narrative (Rukhnama). This paper aims to explore the “Holy Book” Rukhnama, written by Saparmyrat Niyazov, the first president of Turkmenistan, in 2001 by analyzing its rhetorical features and underlying nationalist and militarist discourses Niyazov employed in order to not only build the Turkmen nation-state but also reshape and (re)gender the collective memory of citizens. Niyazov's two-volume book Rukhnama provides a contextual official discourse to understand the gendered construction of the collective national memory. In this paper I, first of all, situate Turkmenistan and Turkmen nationalism within the literature of nationalism. Second, I provide a historical background on Rukhnama, Turkmenistan and Niyazov. Third, I analyze Rukhnama, identify national and military myths, and discuss their function in the shaping the gendered memory of nationalism. I will cover the following questions to conceptualize the notion of gendered memory in Rukhnama: Where are women described and conceptualized in the linear and fixed single-site representation of official history? How are they represented? How does the book shape the memory on women? Which men and which women are remembered in the book? In the nexus of the national(ist) memory-gendered and militarised discourse, I will primarily focus on the construction of femininities and masculinities through education.

Women’s Nationalism: Love and Hate, Loyalty and Betrayal
Nagehan Tokdoğan, Hacettepe University, Turkey
ntokdogan@gmail.com

The feminist literature focusing on the relation between nationalism and gender developed more around arguments on how the female identity was effectively instrumentalized and occupied quite a central place in the establishment and reproduction of the nationalist discourse. The feminist critique which states that nationalism, a male ideology, objectifies and imprisons women both practically and discursively in patriarchal roles, brought with itself the risk of solidifying women's identity as both the passive carrier and the reproducer of ideology, functioning in the boundaries of nationalism. Ultimately, this notion prepared a platform for interpreting the relationship between women’s identity and nationalism as a one-sided determined relationship. In other words, feminist literature, which was shaped around the questions of what nationalism did to/with women, remained insufficient in asking the question (which might be even more important for the feminist perspective) of what women did to/with nationalism.

In this presentation, I will expose how organized nationalist women, who are active political participants in the youth section “Ülkü Ocakları” (Hearths of Ideal) of the official representative of Turkey’s nationalist ideology party MHP (Nationalist Movement Party) and who can, thus, be marked as subjects of nationalist discourse, perceive, comment, make sense, experience and support this male ideology. Based on critical feminist analysis of the interviews that I conducted with 15 nationalist women, I aim to comprehend and explain the place of the nationalist discourse in their lives and hence to look beyond the one-sided determined relationship from discourse to subject. To conclude, I will try to assess the importance and the meanings of fractures and leakages between the words and feelings created by the nationalist discourse in women’s nationalist discourse.
The military is a school, a school to be a man. You enter as a young boy and exit it as a useful man. You learn how to beat someone, to be intolerant, not to be feminine, to show your power and to win. You internalize the hegemonic masculinity. Moreover, it is generally the state which encourages and enforces you to internalize it.

Many LGBTI individuals decide to take the pink report (a report which exempts someone from the military service) in order not to take part of this process/institution in which an aggressive masculinity is promoted and femininity is humiliated. However, the process by which the pink report is acquired is not an easy one. Although LGBT organizations give counseling about the process, the number of those who are able to take the report is far less than the number of those who apply for it.

The Turkish Armed Forces (TSK) define homosexuality as an "advanced psychosexual disorder". Although homosexuality is not a crime in the Turkish Penal Code, it is considered as an "unnatural sexual relation" in the statute which safeguards the discipline in the military and is evaluated within the scope of the heaviest crimes. When “convinced” that they gay, TSK excludes these men with "rotten" reports in order to protect the "healthy" men of the barracks. However, to prevent people who do not want to do their military service by claiming, "I am gay" or "I am trans", it implements a humiliating process which is against human dignity. These implementations are human right violations and they lead to traumatic experiences. A method which has been practiced until recently, among many others, was to require photos of these men who want to be exempted from the service in an anal intercourse with another man—a method which initiated a public debate in Turkey and in Germany after a German newspaper published an article entitled "Turkish military has the largest porn archive".

In this presentation, I will explain the process through which pink reports are given and, through examples from this process, try to demonstrate how the system associates military service with masculinity.

Military Education in Turkey: Military Masculinities and Contemporary Politics
Elif Irem Az, Sabancı University, Turkey
iremaz@sabanciuniv.edu

While previous research on the military and militarism in Turkey mostly focused on civil-military relations or on the impact of compulsory military service on men’s lives, there is a long standing silence of and about the cadets and professionals of Turkish Armed Forces (TAF) except for the official discourse of the military. Based on semi-structured, open-ended and in-depth interviews as well as participant observation with men of different backgrounds who were cadets between 2003 and 2013, this study traces the existing military education as a disciplinary and homosocial process controlling bodies, space and time. TAF has been severely affected by the recent Ergenekon and Balyoz operations. Furthermore, rising neoliberalism since the Justice and Development Party came to power in 2002, have had repercussions upon the meaning and advantages of being a professional member of TAF. My research introduces how these two lines of macro level transformations find reflections in the narratives of former cadets as a discrepancy between the discourse that surrounds them during military education as future ‘protectors of the nation’, and the civilian and military life
which awaits them after graduation. It is not only about the shift in the political positionality of TAF and rising neoliberalism which creates the perception of ‘infinite opportunities that exist outside the military zones’ among the cadets and military officers, but also about the ways in which these developments, together with the intensified discipline within the schools as a result of the fear created within the institution, threaten and transform military masculinities. This paper finally argues that two fundamental components of military education, that had been playing a crucial role in maintaining the disciplinary stability of military schools, very recently started to be challenged by officer-teachers, and thus, to transform military masculinities: Men’s friendship and traditional disciplinary bargain between junior and senior cadets.

Living in a Bell-Jar: Governing the Children of Military Families and the Making of Military Dependents
Sertaç Kaya Şen, Sabancı University, Turkey
sertascen@sabanciuniv.edu

Of all its uses in the nation-state, one of the most salient features of the military institution in Turkey has been its (sometimes self-) invitation to regulate the tensions inside the country. Just to name few examples, the military has endeavored to regulate the tensions inside by functioning as an ideological state apparatus. Numerous times, as in the unacknowledged war waged to put an end to “the Kurdish Question,” the military opted to thump its iron fist. It has played a significant role in the governmentalization of the modern nation-state and controlling of populations.

This feature of the military in Turkey begs a particular question: If the institution has an immense role in the governance and regulation of internal tensions along different axes, how does it govern the tensions arising and regulate the figures living within its own institutional boundaries in order to render its services more effective and legitimate? Especially at stake here is the controlling of whom the judicial discourse of the military pigeonholes as “the military dependents,” most notably children born to the military complex and raised by "military families” in which at least one parent works as a commissioned professional soldier. So if we revise the former question, this study particularly seeks answers to the following: How do the military families and the military institutions live with the possibility that these children can become fugitives, rottens, deserters, conscientious objectors, or slip out of the matrix of compulsory heterosexuality in an environment and a nation where hegemonic modes of masculinity are privileged and “the myth of the military nation” still prevails? In that regard, I suggest that the examination of the these children’s lives yields fruitful results in the understanding of different modes of “governmentality” employed by the military institution and efforts poured into raising children responding to the expectations of the institution and/or military families.

Accordingly, this study is based on an ethnographic research drawing on in-depth interviews conducted with "military brats" and field work carried within the military complex. It proposes that the military exercises institutional control over children, with the caveat that this control should not be only understood along the lines of “technologies of domination.” Otherwise, I suggest, we would have bypassed the juxtaposition of the ‘ease’ and ‘peace’ that many of my interlocutors feel within the confines of an institution identified by its strict discipline, the command of ‘Attention!’ and ‘warfare’. Rather, I argue, the enclosure of these children has to do less with a desire to repress subjects and more with producing regularities in them to produce nationalized, gendered and militarized subjectivities catering to the norms and interests of the military institution.

“No Peace Without Justice”: State Crimes and Military Victims in Turkey’s Anti-Coup Trials
Senem Kaptan, Rutgers University, USA
senemkaptan@gmail.com

Soldiers are the ultimate examples of sacrificial subjects; ordinary men made into “mythic” heroes who, in the name of the nation, willingly give up their lives for the protection of the state, sometimes
going so far as to harm the people they initially set out to protect. This paper examines what happens when this act of protection, embraced as their prime duty by servicemen, comes to be seen as a crime against the nation, through an ethnographic examination of the polemical civil trials of military officers accused of coup plotting in contemporary Turkey as part of the Balyoz (Sledgehammer) case. These anti-coup trials have been unprecedented in the country’s history as one of the first momentous attempt to challenge the military’s legitimacy. Yet, despite being portrayed as part of a transition from military exceptionalism to the rule of law, the process itself has been fraught with irregularities. Labeled as “a post-modern Dreyfus affair” by the military families, the trials have immensely shocked the family members alongside being a source of public humiliation and resentment towards the Turkish Armed Forces for not defending its officers. And in a country where the state apparatus has historically left so many as victims of state violence, the families’ continuous attempt to appropriate the category of victims has met with continuous failure for them to be publicly recognized as such. Based on life history interviews with military families, participant observation in public demonstrations and prison visits, a close reading of court transcripts as well as memoirs and books by prosecuted military officers and their families, this paper sheds a close look at how the trials have transformed the lives of these “fallen elites” who have not only had to question their sense of self and belonging, but were also held accountable for the past crimes of the state for which they were personally not responsible. In this context, rather than espousing a taken-for-granted approach to state actors as protectors of official memory, this paper examines how state actors appropriate, challenge, or reconstruct this memory, and can themselves also become sources of counter-memory, in this particular case by questioning the state’s past crimes against the government’s attempt to represent the trials as addressing the military’s wrongdoings of the past. Situated within this tension between military exceptionalism and the narrative of the rule of law, this paper examines what happens when soldiers, previously legitimate actors of the state whose violent acts against citizens were legally sanctioned, and their families, become a social, political, and legal “excess,” an unsustainable liability to the state apparatus they were meant to represent and uphold, and asks what constitutes the parameters of legitimate victimhood in the competing realm of moral demands to socially recognizable “true” suffering and justice. In so doing, this paper aims to critically examine what makes the rule of law legitimate and whether justice is equally possible for everyone the law purportedly represents when the memories of violence perpetrated by an institution become attached to all of its members.

Gendered Representations in Literature and Cinema
16.15 - 18.00
Discussant: Sibel Irlık, Sabancı University

The Spectralized Other: Gendered Loss in Assia Djebar’s La Femme sans sépulture
Lucy Brisley, Ecole Normale Supérieure de Lyon, France
lucybrisley@gmail.com

Algeria is today inextricably linked to its violent past and its ostensibly repetitive patterns of violence (McDougall; Stora). Having fought the French in the bloody anticolonial war of 1954-62, it suffered the devastation of a civil war during the 1990s, which was eerily dubbed the ‘second Algerian War’. Published in 2003, Assia Djebar’s novel La Femme sans sépulture treats the memory of the Algerian War of decolonization from a gendered point of view; in particular it returns to the real life history of resistance fighter Zoulikha Oudai, who was raped and murdered by French soldiers. Unsurprisingly, given Algeria’s masculine-oriented ‘glorious’ myth of martyrdom, Zoulikha’s story has not so much been repressed as erased from the postcolonial narrative of the Algerian nation-state. To borrow from Judith Butler’s recent scholarship on memorialization and war (2009), Zoulikha remains an ‘ungrievable’ figure who does not even figure as absence. In line with the tropes of spectrality and haunting that pervade the current and widespread ‘memory boom’—the former inspired in large part
by Jacques Derrida’s *Spectres de Marx* (1993)—in *La Femme sans sépulture* Djebar ‘resurrects’ Zoulikha as a spectralized figure who recounts her history from beyond the grave. For many scholars today, haunting figures as an ethical act of resistance since its repetitive and liminal nature resists processes of mourning or amnesia. Nonetheless, *La Femme sans sepulture* reveals a certain disquiet which troubles the current theoretical valorization of discourses of spectrality. This paper will develop this further to ask: to what extent is the figure of the phantom a wholly useful or ethical figure in mnemonic discourse? Indeed, historically, the racialized other was figured by the colonizers as a haunting, disruptive presence that was ‘not quite’ human; the ghostly colonized other was also linked to sorcery and irrationality and thus the phantom carries with it certain colonial stereotypes that are deep-rooted in western society. Not only is Zoulikha a racialized figure, however, but she is also a gendered one, compelling us to question to what extent Djebar’s text risks feeding into colonial discourse that imagined the racialized (often gendered) body as a spectral other. I would argue that Djebar’s text self-consciously engages with such anxieties and, as such, this paper will analyze the ways in which *La Femme sans sépulture* both deploys and troubles the trope of haunting, ultimately asking to what extent the novel problematizes the wider use of such tropes in current scholarship on memory.

**Literary representations of women during and after the India and Pakistan partition (1947)**
Ana Gatica Uhlir, Universidad Del Salvador, Argentina
anagaticau@hotmail.com

Recently I had the opportunity to attend, in Lahore, a performance by Indian actor Naseeruddin Shah about the conflictive relationship between India and Pakistan, and in his presentation, Salima Hashmi (the daughter of the famous Pakistani poet, Faiz Ahmed Faiz), said that artists are the ones who find the words that people need to express their emotions, feelings and deepest sentiments, thus rendering them the voice of their societies. This is very much the case of writers, especially writers in India and Pakistan dealing with the difficult and in most of the cases, painful, topic of partition. The 1947 partition of the British Indian Empire gave birth to three different countries, the Republic of India and the Islamic Republic of Pakistan and in a later stage, the People’s Republic of Bangladesh. This process, which was not devoid of violence, is considered one of the big human tragedies of the 20th century.

This paper will try to explore how Indian and Pakistani writers address this particularly violent political process by focusing on what kind of images of women they describe in their texts and how they present and represent their roles and statuses in the two post-independence societies. Literature is the window that allow us to come across with the encounter of the personal experiences (that of the characters) and the macro-political and historical processes, it presents us with fragments, pieces of the reality puzzle that help in the reconstruction of a particular historical period. The purpose of this project is to compare the authors’ views trying to find similarities and differences in the way human experiences are portrayed, especially focusing on female agency. Literature, as opposed to politics, is the field where past grievances can be negotiated, understanding can be reached or at least accepted as a fictional reality, and artistic and psychological explorations can be done, thus opening space for debate and engagement with historical facts and critical analysis of the present day developments. All in all, this paper will suggest that literate is a flexible and tolerant field in which political and social ideas can be discussed and solution to problems rehearse.

**What is a Man without a Pistol and a Pennis: Deconstructing the Hero in Serbian Films about the Great War**
Dragan Batancev, Central European University, Hungary
batancevd@yahoo.com

The huge disproportion in number of films about World War II and World War I in socialist Yugoslavia and its successor states is the consequence of the former war having been viewed as the
prolonged birthday of a multinational utopia, while the latter was deemed the first step towards creating the bourgeois Kingdom of Yugoslavia, marked by the Serbian hegemonism. Curiously enough and contrary to the logic of repressed nationalism, the two Serbian spectacles about the Great War – both revolving around the Battle of Cer, the first Allied victory over the Central Powers – remained far from glorifying the Serbian hero liberating his South Slavic brothers, as the official Serbian history has it.

*The Drina March* (1964) is based on Serbian officers’ diaries, including memories of the director’s father. Its protagonist is a lieutenant Veca, a latent homosexual whose rich Belgrade family wanted him to stay in the rear. Veca is desperately trying to prove his masculinity both to his superiors and privates, even though most of them are not aware of their own gender related issues: the misogynistic Major looks forward to participating in yet another bloodshed; the conservative Sergeant accepts congratulations for getting his wife pregnant with quadruplets, knowing he might not see them alive when his commander lies just to keep him with the squad; the cynical Gambler admits he became a bum after his wife cheated on him. As the fatalistic interest of the Fatherland comes before that of the reason, Veca has no other choice but to die together with other soldiers, thus finally earning their respect. Quite expectedly, the reactions to *The Drina March* have been ranging from secretly persecuting its director for the reputed nationalism, to the sporadic critiques of depicting Serbs as cowards, and the nationwide acclaim for celebrating the war victory; but so far it has not been recognized as a genderly connoted film aiming at subverting the uniformed national memory.

*St. George Shoots the Dragon* (2009) is inspired by the true story its famous screenwriter heard from his grandfather about the disabled Balkan war veterans having been sent to Cer after the rumors of them making moves on fellow villagers’ wives had reached the front line. The central love triangle features a one-armed veteran and his feminist ex-fiancée, married to his able-bodied and tolerant friend, fighting with temptation of taking revenge on the veteran. Also set against the backdrop of the struggle between the state populist ideology and a seemingly weak individual, the film makes a strong case not only for the transgressiveness of the invalids’ sexual potency, but also for how a disabled man, no matter how virile he is, can never become a part of the national body. Although supported by governments of both the Republic of Serbia and the Republika Srpska as one of the most expensive Serbian films ever, *St. George...* received lukewarm reception due to its unflattering portrayal of the past. A critic Pavle Levi has pointed out to a disturbing fact that parts of the film were shot near the Omarska death camp run by Bosnian Serb forces in the 1992-1995 war, and so, while the film itself is openly critical of Serbian history, it would be worthwhile arguing whether the filmmakers should have more directly declared their attitude about the more recent war trauma.

“Wounded” Men of Turkey’s New Cinema
Burçin Kalkın, Ankara University, Turkey
burcin.kalkin@gmail.com

Cinema is an important space of production and reproduction of femininity and masculinity myths; it provides an opportunity for vital discussions and evaluations. Cinema does not only offer a vast opportunity to create fantasies, identities and myths by means of heroes, but it also provides important clues about social crises, changes, and transformations regarding sexual identities. As cultural products, films introduce significant data in terms of discussing masculine violence towards women as well as the relationship of organized masculine violence with power, with the hierarchical fight in homo-social environments, and with militarism in the sociological and cultural context of Turkey.

The crucial topic that generates and nurtures/maintains the crisis of masculinity is the civil war between the Kurdish movement and the Turkish army. Compulsory military service forces every man to face with such realities as war, heroism, and death. These masculinity codes are also carried into films in different forms.
Cinema in Turkey thus becomes a ground on which myths on fighter men, on their heroism and victories are produced. Being a martyr and becoming a veteran are represented as men’s honor and dignity; military service creates an important discourse of national bravery. While the militarist and nationalist discourse in the post 1990 Turkey, when the war spread over into daily life, was reproduced in popular cinema, it is possible to discern some fractures in this discourse and representation; the masculine representation and heroic myths are questioned in Turkey’s New Cinema.

In this research three films will be analysed through the following questions: how are veterans trying to recover from war trauma constructed, and what do the narratives on these characters tell us about the forms of the masculinity crisis? How is war remembered in films? How is trauma experienced after war and how is it transmitted to the everyday life? The relationship between war memory and the everyday will be discussed in the context of the following three films: Yazı-Tura (Heads or Tails)(Uğur Yücel, 2004), Başka Semtin Çocukları (Children of a Different District) (Aydın Bülut, 2008), and Tepenin Ardı (Beyond the Hill)( Emin Alper, 2012). Thus, the transformation in the representation of the relationships between the military, war and masculinity in Turkey’s Cinema will be questioned.

Closing Panel: Militarism and Its Witnesses
18:15 – 19:30
Merve Arkun, Eren Keskin, Rela Mazali
Moderator: Bürge Abiral (Organizing Committee)

Born in 1990, Merve Arkun spent her life in Bursa until she moved to Izmir for university. After starting to pay regular visits to İzmir Şirinyer Military Prison and Buca Prison to see İnan Süver, who had been arrested in 2011 for being a conscientious objector, she participated in the İzmir chapter of “The Initiative of Conscientious Objection for Peace.” In 2011, she announced her conscientious objection in order to reject both compulsory military service and the militarist culture as a whole, and said, “I turn people against military service... I declare my conscientious objection.” After moving to Istanbul in 2011, Arkun joined the movement of Conscientious Objection for Peace, participated in many events on conscientious objection and anti-militarism, and conducted studies on these issues. She presented on Conscientious Objector Women in the Mesopotamian Social Forum held in Diyarbakır in 2011, highlighting the importance of the participation of women in the struggle for the deciphering of the militarization of everyday life. Now serving as co-president of Conscientious Objection Association established in 2013, Arkun continues her active struggle in the movement of conscientious objection.

Eren Keskin is a lawyer and human rights activist in Turkey. She is the vice-president of the Turkish Human Rights Association (İHD) and a former president of its Istanbul branch. She co-founded the project and the office of “Legal Aid For Women Who Were Raped Or Otherwise Sexually Abused by National Security Forces”, to expose sexual and other state violence directed mostly to Kurdish women in Turkish prisons due to the war between Turkish Armed Forces and Kurdistan Workers’ Party (Partiya Karkerên Kurdistan-PKK), and to provide legal support to those women. She has been the object of numerous lawsuits in relation to her human rights activities. In 1995 she was imprisoned for her activities and was adopted as a prisoner of conscience by Amnesty International. In 2004 she received the Aachen Peace Award “for her courageous efforts and activities for human rights.” In 2005 she was awarded the Esslingen-based Theodor Haecker Prize for Civic Courage and Political Integrity. Keskin also worked as the General Editor of the newspaper Özgür Gündem [Free Agenda]. She continues her activism at Legal Aid For Women Who Were Raped Or Otherwise Sexually Abused by National Security Forces as a lawyer, and she writes columns for newspapers.

Rela Mazali is an author, an independent scholar, and a feminist anti-militarist activist from Israel; Active against Israel’s occupation since 1980, one of the founders of the New Profile movement to

Closing Remarks: Doğu Durgun & Sertaç Kaya Şen (Organizing Committee)